NATIONAL COMPANY LAW APPELLATE TRIBUNAL, NEW DELHI

Company Appeal (AT) (Insolvency) No. 173 of 2019

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Ranjan Goyal

...Appellant

Vs.

Sharad Vadehra

...Respondent

Present: For Appellant: - Mr. Vivek Sibal, Mr. Rahul Sharma and Mr. Yash Patel, Advocates.

For Respondent: - Mr. Vipul Srivastav and Mr. Aditya, Advocates.

<u>O R D E R</u>

02.09.2019— The Respondent- 'Sharad Vadehra, allottee ('Financial Creditor') filed an application under Section 7 of the Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code, 2016 ("I&B Code" for short) against 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor'). The Adjudicating Authority (National Company Law Tribunal), New Delhi Bench, by impugned order dated 14th January, 2019, admitted the application giving rise to the present appeal preferred by Shareholder.

2. Learned counsel appearing on behalf of the Appellant submits that there was no such agreement between the Respondent- ('Financial Creditor') and 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'-('Corporate Debtor'). The Respondent- ('Financial Creditor') is an allottee of one 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited'. 3. On the other hand, learned counsel for the Respondent- ('Financial Creditor') referring to the records, including the Agreement reached between different parties, submitted that 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' is 100% subsidiary of 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') and both, in consortium, reached an Agreement with 'M/s. Raheja Developers Limited' for development of land, pursuant to which the Respondent, allottee ('Financial Creditor') received Demand Notice on behalf of 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor'). The amount was disbursed for consideration of time value of money and receipt was also issued by 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor').

4. On hearing learned counsel for the parties and on perusal of records, it appears that 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') was incorporated on 22nd November, 2011. It constituted a wholly owned subsidiary namely 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' incorporated on 27th January, 2012. 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') along with 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited 24th July, 2012 and reached Agreement with M/s. Raheja Developers Limited'.

5. Pursuant to Demand Notice dated 27th August, 2012 issued by 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor'), disbursed the amount for which different receipts were issued

by 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor'). Subsequently, Allotment Letter was issued by 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') on 4th January, 2013. Copy of demand letter dated 27th August, 2012 is as follows:

	n – E	s			NONETURE- A-S
	2	2 E			60
	l.	r.			
	1	а Т		v <u>1</u>	
	1	1	HOME	STEAD	
	1		Dem	and Letter	
	j.	2			Date: 27/08/201
Mr./Mr	s. SHARAD M	ADEHRA			
R/o. B-4	483, Meera B	agh Paschim V	ihar		
New De	≥lhi-110063		51		
REF:	Booking of a	Unit admease	aring 5500 sq.ft. in our	up-coming project in S	ector-109, Gurgaon, Haryana.
Dear Si	r/Madam,				
S.No.		ient plan opteo	by you, you are reque Total Due	sted to remit the amou Amount Paid	nt as detailed below: Total Outstanding Amount
	1		(Rs.)	(Rs.)	(Rs.)
1 As state	Basic Sale Pr ed above, we	call upon yo	9900000.00	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe	5900000.00
As state Cheque that all pes no Thankin Yours fa For Gol	ed above, we c/D.D. in favo delayed pay ot finclude Sen ng you, aithfully	r call upon yo r of "GOLDEN ments are sub	9900000.00 u to pay an amount of PEACOCK RESIDENCE Ject to charge of intere be charged as per actu	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe PRIVATE LIMITED" on st @18% per annum fo	5900000.00 es Fifty Nine Lakh Only) throug or before 11/09/2012. Please no or the period of delay. This amou
As state Cheque that all bes no Thankin Yours fa For Gol	ed above, we c/D.D. in favo delayed pay ot include Sen ng you, aithfully den Peacock	r call upon yo r of "GOLDEN ments are sub vice tax & shal Residence Priv	9900000.00 u to pay an amount of PEACOCK RESIDENCE Ject to charge of intere be charged as per actu	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe PRIVATE LIMITED" on st @18% per annum fo	5900000.00 es Fifty Nine Lakh Only) throug or before 11/09/2012. Please no or the period of delay. This amou
As state Cheque that all bes no Thankin Yours fa For Gol	ed above, we s/D.D. in favo delayed pay ot include Ser ng you, aithfully den Peacock	r call upon yo r of "GOLDEN ments are sub vice tax & shal Residence Priv	9900000.00 u to pay an amount of PEACOCK RESIDENCE Ject to charge of intere be charged as per actu	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe PRIVATE LIMITED" on st @18% per annum fo	5900000.00 es Fifty Nine Lakh Only) throug or before 11/09/2012. Please no or the period of delay. This amou
As state Cheque that all bes no Thankin Yours fa For Gol	ed above, we s/D.D. in favo delayed pay ot include Ser ng you, aithfully den Peacock	call upon yo r of "GOLDEN ments are sub vice tax & shal Residence Priv	9900000.00 u to pay an amount of PEACOCK RESIDENCE Ject to charge of intere be charged as per actu	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe PRIVATE LIMITED" on st @18% per annum fc al with the next Instalin with the next Instalin st @1000000000000000000000000000000000000	5900000.00 es Fifty Nine Lakh Only) throug or before 11/09/2012. Please no or the period of delay. This amou nent.
As state Cheque that all bes no Thankin Yours fa For Gol	ed above, we s/D.D. in favo delayed pay ot include Ser ng you, aithfully den Peacock	call upon yo r of "GOLDEN ments are sub vice tax & shal Residence Priv	9900000.00 U to pay an amount of PEACOCK RESIDENCE Ject to charge of intere be charged as per actu- rate Limited	4000000.00 Rs. 5900000 /- (Rupe PRIVATE LIMITED" on st @18% per annum fc al with the next Instalin with the next Instalin st @1000000000000000000000000000000000000	5900000.00 es Fifty Nine Lakh Only) throug or before 11/09/2012. Please no or the period of delay. This amou nent.

6. The receipt of the amount disbursed by the Respondent has been enclosed, one of which is quoted as follows:

	10 1010	•		1.0
		2		109
	and the second s			ι I
(a) attra	HOME	STEAD [™]		
		eipt		
1	Nec	атрс		
MR. SHARAD VADEHRA				
B-483, MEERA BAGH PASCHIM VIHAR				100015 1800000079
PASCHIM VINAR			- nove <u>and and and and and and and and and and </u>	13
NEW DELHI 110063				11.03.2015
Received with thanks payment i	n respect of Fla	at No. 1803 of 6126	So. Ft. in MIC	HAEL SCHUMACHER
WORLD TOWER at Sector- 109 G		trument no. 000331 d		
BANK				
Payment Against Installment	Charges	Particulars	Service	Amount (Rs)
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		Amount (Rs)	Tax (Rs)	
On Casting of 7th Floor Slab	BSP	3,404,902.04	126,254.00	3,531,156.04
On Casting of 3rd Floor Slab On Casting of 3rd Floor Slab	CLUB	27,027.96	835.00	27,862.96
	MEMBERSHIF			
Total	<u> </u>			3,603,963.00
Rupees: (Thirty Six Lakh Three Note: - . 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme	realization of C rm allotment whi	Cheque / Draft.	to availabili	
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible.	realization of (rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standar rable without w created by appli	cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. ritten consent of th icant, the company s	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be	as decidéd
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights	realization of (rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standar rable without w created by appli	cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. ritten consent of th icant, the company s	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be	as decidéd
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. ritten consent of th icant, the company s	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	as decided .
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	as decided .
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	as decided .
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	as decided .
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without wu created by appli ecision shall be	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Farty rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a computation	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be cer generated docu	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. .itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment heuce doesnot rea	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par quire any signat	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a compute Homestead	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms d buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot rec Development Priva 2011PTC227771	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par quire any signat	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a computed of the company of the company. Homestead Corporate Office Unit No.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be cer generated docu cln: U65923DL cc. Plot No.15, 2 nd Floor 502, Bullion D Mall, N	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot red Development Priva 2011PTC227771 Sector-44, Gurgaon (Haryan teaj Subhash Place, Plramp	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited na)-122001 na)-122001	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a computed of the company of the company. Homestead Corporate Office Unit No.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: Plot No.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. .titten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot rec Development Priva 2011PTC227771 Sector44, Gurgaon (Hayan	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited na)-122001 na)-122001	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Farty rights 1 Iable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a comput Homestead Corporate Offin Registered Office: Unit No. Phone: 0124-49	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: Plot No.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot rec Development Priva 2011PTC2277/1 Sector-44, Gurgaon (Haryan letaj Subhash Place, Pitamp 301, Website: www.horneste	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited na)-122001 na)-122001	ties
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject tc 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Party rights liable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a computed of the company of the company. Homestead Corporate Office Unit No.	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: Plot No.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot rec Development Priva 2011PTC2277/1 Sector-44, Gurgaon (Haryan letaj Subhash Place, Pitamp 301, Website: www.horneste	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat: ate Limited ha)-122001 ura, New Delhi-1100: adinfra.com	as decided ties ure, *****
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Farty rights 1 lable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a comput Homestead Corporate Office: Unit No. Phone: 0124-49 EURDING	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: Plot No.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms i buyer's agreement. .titten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot red Development Privaz 2011PTC227771 	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited ha)-122001 ura, New Delhi-1100: adinfra.com	as decided ties ure, *****
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Farty rights 1 lable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a comput Homestead Corporate Office: Unit No. Phone: 0124-49 EURDING	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: Plot No.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms d buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot red Development Priva 2011PTC22771 Sector44, Gurgaon (Haryar etaij Subhash Place, Pltamp 301, Website: www.horneste ations American Real Estate Soci	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited ha)-122001 ura, New Delhi-1100: adinfra.com	as decided ties ure, *****
Note:- 1 This Receipt is subject to 2 This Receipt does not confi of standard Buyer's agreeme by the company and as menti 3 This Receipt is non-transfe 4 For any third Farty rights 1 lable/responsible. 5 In any case the Company's d concerned. ****** This is a comput Homestead Corporate Office: Unit No. Phone: 0124-49 EURDING	realization of C rm allotment whi nt and adhering oned in standard rable without w created by appli ecision shall be car generated docu CIN: U65923DL constructure [CIN: U65923DL rs: PlotNo.15, 24* Floor 502, Building D Mall, N 04800, Fax: 0124-4904	Cheque / Draft. .ch shall be subject to all other terms d buyer's agreement. itten consent of th icant, the company s a final and binding ment hence doesnot red Development Priva 2011PTC22771 Sector44, Gurgaon (Haryar etaij Subhash Place, Pltamp 301, Website: www.horneste ations American Real Estate Soci	to availabili and conditions e company. hall not be on all the par guire any signat ate Limited ha)-122001 ura, New Delhi-1100: adinfra.com	as decided ties ure, *****

7. Allotment Letter dated 4th January, 2013 is also under the heading
'Homestead' is extracted below:

DONEXORE- A-S 62 HOMESTEAD ALLOTMENT LETTER Dated: 04/01/2013 To, Mr./Mrs. SHARAD VADEHRA R/o. B-483, Meera Bagh, Paschim Vihar, New Delhi-110063 Subject: Allotment of Unit against your booking in our Project "Michael Schumacher World Tower", in Sector-109, Gurgaon, Haryana Dear Sir/Ma'am, In response to your application dated 27/06/2012, we hereby allot to you Unit No. 1803, admeasuring 6126 sq. ft. (tentative) in the said project "Michael Schumacher World Tower", in Sector-109, Gurgaon, Haryana. The allotment of said Unit No. 1803 is subject to terms and conditions as mentioned in standard Flat Buyer's Agreement, which will be sent to you in due course of time. For any further information or clarifications, please feel free to get in touch with us on our Customer Care email-id customercare@homestead-india.com Thank you for your investment in our esteemed project. For Golden Peacock Residence Pvt. Ltd. isham (Authorized Signatory) 202 Golden Peacock Residence Pvt. Ltd. ent Pvt. i.td.) (Wholly owned subsidiary of Homestead Infrastructure Develop Plot No. 15, 2rd Floor, Sector-44, Gurgaon - 122001, INDIA. Ph.:: 0124-4904800, 0124-4904899, Fax : 0124-4904801, www.homeste nestead-india.com Affiliations IBERE American Real Estate Society institute for Behavioral and Experimental Real Estate TRUE COPY OCATE

8. From the aforesaid allotment letter, demand notice, allotment letter and receipt, we find that there is a joint venture between 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') and 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' and, therefore, the Appellant cannot take the plea that 'Homestead' is not a 'Corporate Debtor'.

9. The Adjudicating Authority noticed the relevant facts, including an e-mail dated 7th June, 2014 on behalf of 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') asking the 'Financial Creditor' to draw the cheque in the name of 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited', which reads as follows:

"Tanya Bector<u>Tanya.bector@homestead-india.com</u> To: Sharad Vadehra <u>vadehra666@gmail.com</u> Dear Mr. Vadehra Greetings for the day, Please find below the RTGS details of Golden Peacock: Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited A/C No. 912020031148652 IFSC Code: UTIB0000056 Swift Code: AXISINBB056 Bank: Axis Bank Please intimate us with the status as to coordinate with the bank. Warm regards, Tanya Bector."

10. From the aforesaid facts, as we find that 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') reached agreement jointly with 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' have entered into the development agreement with 'M/s. Raheja Developers Limited' on 24th July, 2012 and for all purposes it is a joint venture with 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' who is a subsidiary company and reached agreement with Respondent, but asked to pay the amount to 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited', we hold that the application under Section 7 against 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'- ('Corporate Debtor') is maintainable.

11. Learned counsel for the Appellant informed that 'M/s. Raheja Developers Limited' has sold its all the rights to 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' in the year 2015, but that will not change the complexion of the matter as in place of 'M/s. Raheja Developers Limited', 'M/s. Golden Peacock Residence Private Limited' will be the Developer jointly with 'M/s. Homestead Infrastructure Development Pvt. Ltd.'-('Corporate Debtor').

In absence of any merit, we dismiss the appeal. No costs.

(Justice S.J. Mukhopadhaya) Chairperson

> (Justice A.I.S. Cheema) Member(Judicial)

> > (Kanthi Narahari) Member(Technical)

Ar/g